

MEETING MINUTES
Washington Beverage Container Initiative – Project Kick-Off Meeting
August 31, 2006

The Rhode's Center – 950 Broadway / Tacoma, WA 98402

Stakeholders Present: *Please review attached stakeholder list with contact information*

Desired Outcomes:

- *Shared understanding of key interests and concerns of all stakeholders.
- *Shared understanding of “the status quo” (what we do and don’t know), including more information about the current state of beverage container recycling in Washington and key elements of other successful programs.
- *Agreement that there are opportunities to increase recycling and decrease disposal of beverage containers.
- *Agreement on the principles of a viable strategy to increase beverage container recycling in Washington.
- *Identification of opportunities for collaboration:
 - Identity follow-up needed to determine resource commitments
 - Identify follow-up needed to develop potential projects

Meeting Process Highlights:

- Stakeholders introduced themselves and their representative organizations
(Please review attached stakeholder attendance list for more information)
- Stakeholder Interests and Concerns
The following question was first posed to stakeholders:
---With respect to increasing the recycling and decreasing the disposal of beverage containers, what are you most interested in and/or what are you most concerned about?
After this question was posed, each stakeholder present identified with a given color of marker, depending on which group they represented, and had approximately 5 minutes to write down their answers to this question on sticky notes. Afterward, all sticky notes were posted onto butcher paper on the wall. Then all the stakeholders analyzed the different comments on the wall and began to sort the answers into specific issue categories. Once this process was complete, a vote was taken and stakeholders unanimously decided that they wished to view the panel presentations immediately to gain more information about beverage container recovery before continuing group discussions.

- Panel Presentations (please review attached PowerPoint document)
A question and answer session followed each presentation. After all of the presentations, it was noted that no industry representative had been able to present on the panel and the facilitator opened the forum to any industry representative who wished to give information to the larger group.
- Break-Out into Small Groups for Issue Specific Categories
From the numerous categories formed by the stakeholders, four main categories were created: How to Collect (collection issues), Consumer Education/Responsibility,

Recovery and The System/Data Issues. Container Design was an additional category which was not discussed. Stakeholders grouped themselves around each issue they wished to discuss in-depth and conversations began. After 30 minutes, the groups elected a speaker to disseminate the information to the larger group via small group presentations with a question and answer period following each presentation. The discussions and presentations used the following guidelines:

---Small Group Discussion:

Initial Directions

***Identify the following:**

- 1) What are the issues/barriers?
- 2) What are some potential solutions?
- 3) What are the critical linkages?

Outcomes

***What did we hear?**

***What are our reactions?**

***What is missing? (Information, Data Gaps, Etc...)**

***Identify a Representative to Report out to the large group**

The outcomes from this section are highlighted in the following section.

◦ Opportunities for Collaboration / Next Steps and Action Items

After the small group discussions ended, the larger group reconvened and a discussion ensued surrounding a reflection of the topics of the small groups and areas for collaboration. From this discussion, next steps and action items were also decided upon.

(Please see the following sections for detail about the opportunities for collaboration / next steps and action items)

Interests and Concerns:

This section corresponds to the initial brainstorm by stakeholders regarding interests and concerns with respect to increasing the recycling and decreasing the disposal of beverage containers. These minutes also reflect the small group discussions and presentations which were centered around four categories based on this initial brainstorm: How to Collect (collection issues), Consumer Education/Responsibility, Recovery and The System/Data Issues.

Category #1: HOW TO COLLECT (curbside, bottle bill, public areas, quality)

BRAINSTORM SESSION

~Curbside

*Costs/Impacts of Beverage Container Recycling on Curbside Programs

*Litter Issues

*I am most interested in capturing on-the-go beverage containers for recycling

*Concerns: Logistics for providing a system to recover on-the-go containers

*Easy Container Accessibility (i.e. Curbside programs capture a lot – but need to increase event/public areas/roadside, etc...)

*How to Boost Curbside Programs in Washington state to increase recycling.

*Concerned about loss of beverage containers mis-sorted at MRFs that get disposed at paper mills – interested in solving this.

*Reducing contamination from particular sectors

*Interested in: Use of Curbside Programs

- *Glass Contamination
- *Concern about single stream quality
- *Concern: single stream
- *I want glass recycling at curb

~Recycling on the Go

- *“Recycling on the Go” at malls. Venues such as casinos, parks, etc...
- *Increased events collection and recycling

~Bottle Bill

- *No Bottle Bill Deposit
- *Preventing a forced deposit “Bottle Bill” system
- *Concerned about bottle bill
- *Interested in likelihood of bottle bill
- *Interest in container deposit legislation

~Msc.

- *Fairness Among Container Types – Level playing field
- *Fairness among waste stream sources, containers are only 3% of stream
- *Diversion does not equal recycling
- *Interested in: Enhanced/Expanding curbside recycling
- *More integration of curbside: incentives for consumers in curbside pricing
- *Quality: Don’t treat commodities as garbage
- *Storage, i.e. Sanitation space

Small Group collaboration results:

1) Issues/Barriers

Issues:

- Curbside Programs (Single vs. Dual or more, sorting systems, quality)
- Reuse of beverage containers, esp. wine bottles
- Bar/restaurant (commercial) collection – need disincentive to throwing in garbage
 - *commercial recyclables and garbage collected by volume, not weight
 - *takes up little space
- Event Recycling
 - *many water bottles now used
- Diversion not an accurate measure of recycling
 - *contamination can cause recyclables to be disposed

Barriers:

- More separation = labor intensive
 - *contamination
- Cost of sorting by recycler and at MRF
- Any damage to wine bottles, issue of aesthetics
- Much variance in types of wine bottles
- Wine Labeling requirements by states
- Events: need education, contamination with garbage
- Recyclability of plastic bottles (example: caps)
- Need large volume: lightweight so expensive to transport

2) Solutions

- Dual Stream Containers --- glass, aluminum, plastic = no curbside contamination, easily sorted
- Glass collected separately from rest of materials
- Need better bins at events so people know they are for recycling
 - ~signage: can see it is *not* garbage
- Use of youth/charity groups for post-event sweeps
- True Recycling on the go: Gas stations, malls, supermarkets, etc...
- Increased incentives for bar/restaurant recycling
- Consumer education re: recycling and contamination and **must make it convenient and clear where to recycle**
- corporate involvement in recycling (example: logos on bins)
- Communicate energy savings message to consumers

---Category #2: CONSUMER EDUCATION/CONSUMER RESPONSIBILITY

BRAINSTORM SESSION

- *Consumer Role
- *Changing the public perception of and attitude on consumption of resources
- *Educating the public
- *Public Outreach and Education
- *Consumer Responsibility
- *Consumer Education

Small Group collaboration results:

1) Issues/Barriers

- attitudes
- cultural/language
- understand our target audience
 - *what drives behavior?
- what to communicate, who to and how often?

2) Solutions

- “Buy-in” and reaching from target audiences/consumer
- simplicity of the message to consumers
- good funding

3) Critical Linkages

- collection

---Category #3: RECOVERY

BRAINSTORM SESSION

- *Local value-added processing
- *Decreased disposal of resources
- *Markets: How to improve markets for collected materials
- *Increasing recovery

- *Increasing the recycling rate
- *Increase recovery of all additional container types
- *Conserving landfill space
- *Maximizing diversion of containers to preserve landfill space either through recycling or product stewardship
 - *creating comprehensive recycling programs
 - *Quantity: we want more
 - *More stuff – especially the valuable
 - *Improvements in recovery at home, work and on-premise
 - *No Sham Recycling
 - *Combined effort to maximize recovery at the curb and MRF's
 - *Most interested in increasing volume of glass that is feeding the recycling stream.
- *Most concerned with increasing volume being sent to landfills

Small Group collaboration results:

1) Issues/Barriers

- *Hauler Driven vs. Cost
 - a) who bears the cost?
- *Quality – Contamination
- *Public Education
- *Economic Impact of Single Stream vs. Volume increase in recycling
- *No linkage in system between stakeholders
- *Availability to market
- *Distinction between diversion and recycling
- *Inherent conflict of interest between disposal and recycling

2) Solutions

- *Mandatory Recycling and Pay as you throw (consumer pays for recycling)
- *Comprehensive Program that links stakeholders and eliminates conflicts of interest
- *Identify Best Management Practices
- *Establish long-term markets
- *Continuing consumer education

3) Critical Linkages

- *Haulers
- *Public/Consumer
- *Government
- *Processors
- *Manufacturers/Distributors/Retailers
- *Fair Allocation of recycling revenue collected
 - revenue neutral

--Category #4: THE SYSTEM (Innovations/Finance/Consensus/Statewide and Data Issues)

BRAINSTORM SESSION

THE SYSTEM

- *State-wide coverage
- *Considering all of the state
- *Involve entire stakeholder Chain
- *Financial: what are the costs for different stakeholders?
- *Financing mechanisms
- *Multi-stakeholder solutions
- *Retailer role in solution
- *Interested in: developing a creative cooperative method to capture the beverage containers not captured by curbside programs
- *Opportunity for flexible system
- *New ideas/out of box thinking while supporting existing infrastructure
- *Doing it cost effectively
- *Innovative and collaborative approaches to improving recovery of beverage containers
- *WSRA is interested/willing to support initiatives that have consensus across our membership
 - *Producers accept more responsibility
 - *Continuing opportunities to work with local governments to create best recycling services for each individual community
 - *Pricing on Materials
 - *Specific solutions to products and size – not one size fits all
 - *COST (i.e. storage handle, etc...)

DATA

- *Concerned about: lack of good data and sales data
- *Information: How do we get the best data on what's happening
- *Quality Data – Aggregate-able and comparable
- *Concerns: Poor data and redundancy of efforts

Small Group collaboration results:

1) Issues/Barriers

- *Data and Metrics
- *What drives markets/how they work

2) Potential Solutions

- *Create National Data Sets
 - meaningful reference points
 - EPA has a model data program that is available
- * “Re-Trac” model: may be valuable regarding data collection
 - “Re-TRAC is a web-based system that has been designed to simplify the process of gathering information about municipal solid waste, recycling, and hazardous waste programs by county and state (or provincial) governments.” (from: http://www.gradingandexcavation.com/mw_news_0812_ekd.html - visit for overview and info.)

- recent meeting occurred about this model
- Project of the Emerge Corporation (President Rick Penner)
- * “translation” programs may be able to convert data into standard measures
- *Increase cost of garbage collection and give credit for recycling
 - “**RECYCLE BANK**” - www.RecycleBank.com
- *Education on state level
- *BC Programs – as an example involving manufacturers
- *Need a better understanding of the markets and economics of how the markets work (possible presentation?)
- *Government and public agencies provide bins in all government and public areas.

---MSC. Category: CONTAINER DESIGN (Material Selection) – was not discussed

- *Increase Uniform Packaging – *was not discussed*

Opportunities/Projects for Collaboration:

The stakeholders agreed that straw-man proposals would be created in relation to the following opportunities/projects for collaboration:

- General/Msc.**
 - *Identify what stakeholder organizations are willing to do/commit
 - *Set boundaries around what we can't do as well
 - *To reach agreement to work around these sets of issues
- Developing Incentives**
 - *recycling/marketing
 - *example: incentive-based recycling programs
 - Get more information about Recycle Bank
- Identify Data Needs**
 - *to be able to reach agreement about status quo
- Examine the Recycling System**
 - *Recycling Process System Stakeholders
 - *Model/Explore System Approaches
 - *Learn more about different systems
 - Other than bottle bill, markets, other successful programs, etc...
 - *Shared Responsibility/Value/Results
 - *Better Access to Collection Systems
 - *Is there a way to promote mandatory recycling?
- Contamination/Ownership Issues**
 - *Required Recycling Content and Recyclability
 - Cross-State Issues with Oregon, Canada, etc...
 - *how do you set boundaries around WA when materials are leaving the state
- Education/Enhancement of curbside recycling/contact with corporations**
 - *manufacturers/distributors are key (example: for special events)
 - *Demonstrating connection with Energy Conservation

Note: The issue of education transcended all of the small group discussions, thus establishing this topic (education) as a unified theme of the stakeholder meeting..

--Public Event Recycling

*How do we integrate recycling into permits for public events?

STRAW MAN PROPOSALS

- 1) Implement projects which work to create shared responsibility in the recycling system, particularly with regard to brand owner involvement (this proposal may overlap with the incentive proposal)
- 2) Develop Incentive Based Recycling Programs
- 3) Create programs to improve/address data collection issues
- 4) Establish methods to decrease contamination in beverage container recycling
- 5) Establish plans and timelines for increasing education regarding beverage container recycling
- 6) Implement projects which work to increase beverage container recycling at public events/venues
- 7) Develop initiatives to increase office/workplace recycling (EPA proposal)

ACTION ITEMS and NEXT STEPS:

WHO	WHAT	BY WHEN
EPA	1) Type and distribute Notes -include hard copy of presentations -include attendees/contact list 2) Establish a date for next meeting and ID presenters -1/2 day meeting (about half of the group was receptive to this idea)	1) Within 2 weeks 2) Tentative date will be established within 2 weeks. Identification of presenters will be ongoing work after the level of other stakeholder assistance is determined.
Attendees	1) Identify presentation topics for second meeting and educational conference calls with e-conferencing 2) Identify potential project ideas and if there is willingness to help develop options 3) Stay plugged into national scene	1) Respond to knudsen.laura@epa.gov (Laura) by Friday, September 22nd with interest in developing educational conference calls. Stakeholder involvement will commence after level of participation has been determined. 2) Respond to knudsen.laura@epa.gov (Laura) by Friday, September 22nd 3) Ongoing

**TENTATIVE DATES AND TIMES FOR UPCOMING
MEETINGS/CONFERENCE CALLS:**

CONFERENCE CALL: Straw Man Proposal Development

*****Date and Time: Wednesday, September 27th, 2006: 1pm – 2pm PST**

CONFERENCE CALL: Educational Conference Call

**---Topics: Other Recycling Systems (Recycle Bank, Canadian Systems, and public
venue recycling and other non bottle bill systems)**

*****Date and Time: Wednesday, October 18th, 2006: 1pm – 3pm PST**

CONFERENCE CALL: Educational Conference Call

---Topics: Data and Contamination Issues

*****Date and Time: Wednesday November 8th, 2006: 1pm – 3pm PST**

**SECOND WA BEVERAGE CONTAINER INITIATIVE STAKEHOLDER
MEETING**

*****Date and Time: Tuesday, November 21st, 2006: 1pm – 5pm PST**

*****Location: TBA**